

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
Meeting Minutes
June 10, 2013

CALL TO ORDER:

Mr. Mike Troutman, Chairperson called the meeting to order at 4:07 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Members Present: Eric Greene Mike Troutman
Mark Jones Kim Tuck
Susan Baldwin (City Commission Liaison)

Members Excused: Dan Buscher and Doug Sofia

Staff Present: Marcel Stoetzel, City Attorney
Glenn Perian, Senior Planner, Planning Dept.
Leona Parrish, Admin. Assistant, Planning Dept.

ADDITIONS / DELETIONS TO AGENDA: None

APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS MINUTES:

**MOTION WAS MADE BY MR. ERIC GREENE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES
AS PRESENTED FOR THE MAY 13, 2013 HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MEETING; SECONDED BY MR. KIM TUCK.**

ALL IN FAVOR, NONE OPPOSED MOTION; MOTION CARRIED.

CORRESPONDENCE: None

OLD BUSINESS: None

NEW BUSINESS:

A) 125 Oaklawn Avenue - (*Request New Roof & Windows for a Fire Damaged Structure*)

Mr. Bill Swintz, Project Manager for Patriot Restoration, LLC was present to speak on behalf of the property owners Arnold & Alicia Rogers. Mr. Swintz provided a roof shingle sample along with the photo of the color to be used, said they were dimensional style shingles.

With no others wishing to speak, Chairperson, Mr. Troutman asked commissioners for a motion.

**MOTION WAS MADE BY MR. MARK JONES TO APPROVE THE REQUEST A
DETERMINATION OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE NEW ROOF AND
WINDOWS FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 125 OAKLAWN AVENUE;
SECONDED BY MR. KIM TUCK.**

Discussion:

Mr. Mark Jones said he had a general question regarding the historic districts when they have cases like this one where they do not have the materials available from 120 years ago; asked what are the general rules when they have to make something look like the original, does it need to appear to be similar in style and appearance and how the standards are set for new materials.

Mr. Mike Troutman stated it would be a judgment of what would be appropriate to what is available with today's standards.

Mr. Kim Tuck stated with some of his projects the State of Michigan Historical Preservation Office said they look at whether or not the materials or product proposed presents the appearance or impression that it is a historical property and if the shape, size and color are reflective of what would have been used in the period when it was originally constructed. Said there are things they would not approve like vinyl windows and prefer the wood replacement sash. Stated wherever possible they do not like to see vinyl siding, but will approve if the house has already had the primary character destroyed by previous renovations.

Mr. Mark Jones stated regarding these windows; they were noted as being wooden windows and he has actually seen this type and they appear to be like the originals and hopefully would meet the modern performance characteristics that are liked. He was not sure regarding the shingles.

Mr. Kim Tuck stated they would prefer the shingles to be wood, but the wood would be very costly to use and would not be practical and would be cost prohibitive to use. Stated this type has been approved by the State of Michigan Historical Preservation Office in the 40 some projects they had done.

Mayor Baldwin stated she appreciated the sharing of detailed information provided.

VOTE TAKEN: ALL IN FAVOR; NONE OPPOSED; MOTION CARRIED.

Mr. Swintz asked if the Historic District Commission would need to approve the exterior paint color. Mr. Glenn Perian stated paint color is not regulated by this Historic District Commission.

Mr. Marcel Stoetzel noted that the motion for approval should have included that it was based on the findings noted in the staff report.

MODIFIED MOTION WAS MADE BY MR. MARK JONES TO APPROVE THE REQUEST FOR NEW ROOF AND WINDOWS WAS BASED ON THE FINDINGS NOTED IN THE STAFF REPORT FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 125 OAKLAWN AVENUE; SECONDED BY MR. KIM TUCK.

VOTE TAKEN: ALL IN FAVOR; NONE OPPOSED; MOTION CARRIED.

PUBLIC COMMENTS: None

COMMENTS FROM COMMISSION MEMBERS AND STAFF: Mr. Mark Jones commented on a conversation he had with Ms. Christine Hilton, Planning Supervisor regarding the

various Historic Districts and what they are trying to preserve. Mr. Mark Jones referenced in particular the Old Advent Town where there are many different architectural styles; his question is what are they trying to preserve, if it is like on Capital Ave. N.E. where they have a distinct style. Said in the Old Advent Town there is a wide range; are they preserving the neighborhood or the style and asked why the rules fit either way and if they are doing it because of the historical nature of the neighborhood where the rules were written to preserve the architectural properties. Stated it seems to him that in a few of our districts there is a difference as to why it was established and what the rules are established to do and they do not seem to be in conjunction.

Mr. Mike Troutman said he believes it is the whole fabric of the neighborhood and try to preserve what is there rather than put some building there that does not fit with the character of the neighborhood.

Mr. Mark Jones noted that the Family Health Center building is not within the same character as the rest of the neighborhood buildings and brings the question to what are they trying to do with these historic districts. And why does the applicant today have to come to them to get approval of their windows and what are they trying to do with that.

Mr. Mike Troutman asked Mr. Marcel Stoetzel if he would be the city attorney attending the Historic District Commission meetings in the future. Mr. Stoetzel stated he did not know.

ADJOURNMENT:

Mr. Mike Troutman, Chair adjourned meeting at 4: 29 P.M.

Submitted by: Leona A. Parrish, Administrative Assistant, Planning Department